Health and Human Rights Journal

DECEMBER 2023, VOLUME 25, NUMBER 2

SPECIAL SECTION

Economic Inequality and the Right to Health

GUEST EDITORS
Gillian MacNaughton, Matt McConnell, A. Kayum Ahmed, and Sylvain Aubry

Publishers
Harvard FXB Centre for Health and Human Rights and Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief
Joseph J. Amon

Executive Editor
Carmel Williams

Student Essay Editors
Gillian MacNaughton and Audrey Chapman

Copy Editor
Morgan Stoffregen

Designer
Catlin Rockman
ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Health and Human Rights Journal began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007 until his sudden death in February 2022. Health and Human Rights Journal is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

Health and Human Rights Journal is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine. It is also included in the Directory of Open Access Journals https://doaj.org/.

PUBLICATION POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 2000 words. Book reviews and Letters to the Editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at http://www.hhrjournal.org/submissions.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu. Author guidelines are available on the Health and Human Rights website (http://www.hhrjournal.org/). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

COPYRIGHT POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors’ work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and Health and Human Rights Journal are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

OPEN ACCESS POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access OA grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds the article processing fee is US$2,000.

BACK ISSUES

As an open access publication, the Health and Human Rights Journal is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at www.hhrjournal.org, including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR’s Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the Health and Human Rights Journal information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit http://www.jstor.org.

MASTHEAD

Publisher
FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University and Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief
Joseph J. Amon

Executive Editor
Carmel Williams

Founding Editor, 1994–1996
Jonathan Mann

Editor, 1997–2007
Sofia Gruskin

Editor-in-Chief, 2008–2022
Paul E. Farmer

Executive Editorial Committee
Varun Gauri
Anand Grover
Tlaleng Mofokeng
Sharifah Sekalala

Editorial Board
Maame Efua Addadzi-Koom
Pamela Andanda
Philip Alston
Jacqueline Bhabha
Agnès Binagwaho
Oscar Cabrera
Audrey Chapman
Brian E. Concannon Jr
Martha Davis
Sheila Davis
Lawrence Gostin
Sofia Gruskin
Aart Hendriks
Howard Hu
Paul Hunt
Stephen P. Marks
Moses Mulumba
Chidi Odinkalu
Jacqueline Pitanguy
Thomas Pogge
Dainius Pūras
Haun Sausy
Margaret A. Somerville
Eric Stover
Gavin Yamey
Alicia Ely Yamin

HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR’s open access policy is made possible through the generous support of The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University, and our institutional consortium members.

EDITORIAL OFFICE

Health and Human Rights Journal
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights
Harvard School of Public Health
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor
Boston, MA 02115, USA
Tel: (1) 617.432.0656
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310
Website: http://www.hhrjournal.org
Email: hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu

Health and Human Rights Journal (online) ISSN 2350–4113
# Table of Contents

## General Papers

1. **Editorial**  
   Realizing the Right to Health: A Long and Winding Road  
   *Joseph J. Amon*

15. Assisted Regulation: Argentine Courts Address Regulatory Gaps on Surrogacy  
   *Patricio López Turconi*

   *Lauren Danielowski*

43. Building a Progressive Reproductive Law in South Africa  
   *Donrich Thaldar*

53. Using Ethics Committees to Justify Force-Feeding Political Prisoners in Israel  
   *Zohar Lederman and Ryan Essex*

67. Why Has a Progressive Court Failed to Protect the Prison Population against COVID-19? Mass Incarceration and Brazil’s Supreme Court  
   *Daniel Wei Liang Wang, Luisa Moraes Abreu Ferreira, Paulo Sergio Coelho Filho, Matheus de Barros, Julia Abraaho Homsi, Mariana Morais Zambom, and Ezequiel Fajrêldines dos Santos*

83. **Perspective**  
   Justice in Transitioning Health Systems  
   *Lucas Miotto and Himani Bhakuni*

91. **Student Essay**  
   *Sabba Salebaigi*

## Special Section: Economic Inequality and the Right to Health

103. **Letter to the Editor**  
   Climate Change as a Risk Factor for Food Insecurity in Spain  
   *Juliette Duffy*

105. **Editorial**  
   Economic Inequality and the Right to Health: On Neoliberalism, Corporatization, and Coloniality  
   *Gillian MacNaughton and A. Kayum Ahmed*

111. The COVID-19 Pandemic as a Tipping Point: What Future for the Right to Health?  
   *Ted Schrecker*

125. Assessing the Human Rights Framework on Private Healthcare Actors and Economic Inequality  
   *Rossella De Falco, Timothy Fish Hodgson, Matt McConnell, and A. Kayum Ahmed*

141. Are Development Finance Institutions Meeting Their Human Rights Obligations in Health?  
   *Anna Marriott, Anjela Taneja, and Linda Oduor-Noah*

155. Economic Inequality, Social Determinants of Health, and the Right to Social Security  
   *Joo-Young Lee*

171. **Perspective**  
   The Equity Effect of Universal Health Care  
   *Anja Rudiger*
Equality Restricted: The Problematic Compatibility between Austerity Measures and Human Rights Law
Michael G. Marcondes Smith

Climate Change and Economic Inequality: Are We Responding to Health Injustices?
Thalia Viveros-Uehara

Pharmaceutical Patents and Economic Inequality
Thomas Pogge

The Legal Determinants of Scarcity: Expanding Human Rights Advocacy for Affordability of Health Technologies
Luciano Bottini Filho