





Health and Human Rights

DECEMBER 2025, VOLUME 27, NUMBER 2

SPECIAL SECTION EXPLORING ACCOUNTABILITY FOR HEALTH RIGHTS

GUEST EDITORS

Paul Hunt and Anuj Kapilashrami

SPECIAL SECTION INSTITUTIONAL CORRUPTION AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN MENTAL HEALTH

GUEST EDITORS

Alicia Ely Yamin, Camila Gianella Malca, and Daniela Cepeda Cuadrado

Publishers

Harvard FXB Center for Health and Human Rights and
Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief Joseph J. Amon

Executive Editor
Carmel Williams

Student Essay Editors
Gillian MacNaughton and Audrey Chapman

Copy Editor Morgan Stoffregen

Editorial Assistant Fiona Campbell

Designer Catlin Rockman

ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Health and Human Rights began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007 until his sudden death in February 2022. Health and Human Rights is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

Health and Human Rights is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine. It is also included in the Directory of Open Access Journals (https://doaj.org/).

PUBLICATION POLICY

Health and Human Rights welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7,000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 3,000 words. Book reviews and letters to the editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at https://www.hhrjournal.org/submissions/.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu. Author guidelines are available on the *Health and Human Rights* website (http://www.hhrjournal.org). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

COPYRIGHT POLICY

Health and Human Rights applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors' work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and Health and Human Rights are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

OPEN ACCESS POLICY

Health and Human Rights does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access these grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds, the article processing fee is US\$2,000.

BACK ISSUES

As an open access publication, *Health and Human Rights* is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at www.hhrjournal.org, including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the *Health and Human Rights* information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit http://www.jstor.org.

Health and Human Rights Journal (online) ISSN 2150-4113

MASTHEAD

Publisher

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University and Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief Joseph J. Amon

Executive Editor Carmel Williams

Founding Editor, 1994–1996 Jonathan Mann

Editor, 1997–2007 Sofia Gruskin

Editor-in-Chief, 2008–2022 Paul E. Farmer Executive Editorial Committee Varun Gauri Anand Grover Tlaleng Mofokeng Sharifah Sekalala

Editorial Board Maame Efua Addadzi-Koom Pamela Andanda Philip Alston Jacqueline Bhabha Agnès Binagwaho Oscar Cabrera Audrey Chapman Brian E. Concannon Jr Martha Davis Sheila Davis Lawrence Gostin Sofia Gruskin Aart Hendriks Howard Hu Paul Hunt Stephen P. Marks Moses Mulumba Chidi Odinkalu Katherine Peeler Jacqueline Pitanguy Thomas Pogge Dainius Pūras Haun Saussy Margaret A. Somerville Eric Stover

Gavin Yamey

Alicia Ely Yamin

HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR's open access policy is made possible through the generous support of the FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University, and our institutional consortium members.

EDITORIAL OFFICE

Health and Human Rights
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights
Harvard School of Public Health
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor
Boston, MA 02115, USA
Tel: (1) 617.432.0656
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310
Website: http://www.hhrjournal.org
Email: hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu

Table of Contents

SPECIAL SECTION: EXPLORING ACCOUNTABILITY FOR HEALTH RIGHTS

- 1 EDITORIAL
 Accountability from Below
 Paul Hunt and Anuj Kapilashrami
- 9 VIEWPOINT
 Fragile Gains, Shifting Mandates: Civil
 Society, State Synergy, and the Future of
 Health Accountability in Maharashtra, India
 Dhananjay Kakade
- 13 VIEWPOINT
 "That's a Definition for a World That Does
 Not Yet Exist": Reflections on Accountability
 from a Participatory Action Research Project
 with People Engaged in the Sex Trades
 Marie-Fatima Hyacinthe, Jessica Peñaranda,
 and Alice M. Miller
- 17 VIEWPOINT
 Voices from the Margins: Citizen-Led Health
 Accountability in Kurdistan
 Goran Zangana, Shokh Mohammad, Baxan
 Jamal, Azadeen M. Amin, Isis Elgibali, and
 Thomas von der Osten-Sacken
- 21 VIEWPOINT
 Te Āo Māori "Accountability": Indigenous
 Ways Toward Partnership and Restorative
 Practice Globally
 Emma Rawson-Te Patu
- 23 VIEWPOINT
 When Independence Meets Accountability:
 Upholding Non-Retrogression in the Human
 Rights System
 Tania Agosti, Andrea Baldwin, Susana T.
 Fried, Jaime M. Gher, Mariah Grant, Alice
 M. Miller, Mindy Jane Roseman, and Nerima
 Akinyi Were

- People-Centered Accountability amid the Gaza Genocide: Doctors Against Genocide, Healthcare Workers Watch, and the Freedom Flotilla Coalition

 Bilal Irfan, Kaden Venugopal, Michelle Anne Cohen, Aayesha Soni, Roberto Daniel Sirvent, Yipeng Ge, Huwaida Arraf, Karameh Kuemmerle, Nidal Jboor, Maysa Hawwash, and Abdulwhhab Abu Alamrain
- 39 Neglected Harms: Health Workers Organizing for Accountability in Tigray Dawit Kassa, Zazie Huml, and Bram Wispelwey
- 51 Accountability for Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights in Humanitarian and Disaster Situations: Case Studies from Uganda, Bangladesh, and Nepal Grady Arnott, Beatrice Odallo, Teddy Nakubulwa, Fazila Banu Lily, and Shankar Singh Dhami
- 65 Human Rights Accountability in Global Health Multi-Stakeholder Partnerships: The Case of the Access to COVID-19 Tools Accelerator Gamze Erdem Türkelli and Rossella De Falco
- 79 Deepening Accountability: The Fair Pharma Scorecard and Access to Medicines in a Fragmented Global Health Law Landscape Rosalind Turkie and Pramiti Parwani
- 95 No Place to Park the Clinic: Accountability, Expropriation, and the Social Function of Property in Pursuit of Health Equity in South Africa Lindani Mhlanga and Tamanda Kamwendo
- Temporal Accountability and Taiwan's National Health Insurance System Tsung-Ling Lee and Chien-Liang Lee

121 Accountability Beyond Blame: Rethinking Maternal Death Surveillance and Response Mulu Beyene Kidanemariam

135 PERSPECTIVE

Accountability Reimagined: Decolonizing Global Health Through Virtue and Subsidiarity Thana C. de Campos-Rudinsky and Daniel Wainstock

143 Chasing Accountability in Global Health:
Reflections from Experience on the
UN Secretary-General's Independent
Accountability Panel on Women's, Children's,
and Adolescents' Health
Alicia Ely Yamin

SPECIAL SECTION: INSTITUTIONAL CORRUPTION AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN MENTAL HEALTH

157 EDITORIAL

Examining Institutional Corruption in Mental Health: A Key to Transformative Human Rights Approaches Alicia Ely Yamin, Camila Gianella Malca, and Daniela Cepeda Cuadrado

- 165 Institutional Corruption in the Political Economy of Global Mental Health: Challenges for Transformative Human Rights Praxis Alicia Ely Yamin and Camila Gianella Malca
- 179 Addressing the Global Mental Health Crisis: How a Human Rights Approach Can Help End the Search for Pharmaceutical Magic Bullets Lisa Cosgrove
- 189 Without Informed Consent: The Global Export of a Failed Paradigm of Care Robert Whitaker

203 Too Big to Lose Weight: How Pharmaceuticalization Corrupts the Right to Health Ximena Benavides

215 Reflections on Institutional Corruption in Mental Health Policy Implementation: Global Insights and the Eastern European Experience

Dainius Pūras and Iulie Hannah

- 229 Regression of Hard-Won Advances in Socialized Medicine: The Emergence of the Private Sector in Health Care in Serbia Milutin Kostić and Danilo Vuković
- 243 A Hard Pill to Swallow: Pharmacy Chain Dominance and the Commodification of Mental Health in Peru Alberto Vásquez Encalada
- 259 When Scaling Up Isn't Enough: The Impacts of Peru's Mental Health Care Reform on Adolescents Camila Gianella Malca
- 273 South Africa's Life Esidimeni Disaster and the Institutional Corruption That Opened the Door to It Sasha Stevenson

GENERAL PAPERS

285 VIEWPOINT
"Politicized" Science and Attacks on Public
Health
Joseph J. Amon

- 291 The State of International Human Rights Law on Sexual and Reproductive Health: An Overview Christina Zampas and Åsa Nihlén
- 305 A Human Rights-Based Approach to Accessing Preimplantation Genetic Testing: The Case of Argentina Berenice Cerra

- 317 Women's Perspectives on Barriers to Skilled Birth Attendance and Emergency Obstetric Care in Rural Tanzania: A Right to Health Analysis Prisca Tarimo, Gillian MacNaughton, Tarek Meguid, and Courtenay Sprague
- 331 Harm Reduction Policing: A Scoping Review Examining Police Training as a Strategy to Overcome Barriers to HIV Services Diederik Lohman, Nina Sun, and Joseph J. Amon

343 PERSPECTIVE

New Legislation Criminalizing Sex Work in Kazakhstan Is Cause for Concern Olivia Cordingley, Natalya Zholnerova, Ekaterina Grigorchuk, Denis Gryazev, Karina Alipova, Sholpan Primbetova, Assel Terlikbayeva, Brooke West, Victoria Frye, and Tara McCrimmon

- 351 Conceptualizing the Child's Right to Oral Health: A Rights-Based Approach to Dental Caries S. Dominique Mollet
- 363 Trialing Over-the-Counter Mild Pain Medication Access in Queensland Prisons: The Experience of Women Prisoners Evonne Miller, Lisa Scharoun, Jane Phillips, Roslyn Williams, Jane Hwang, Abbe Winter, Linda Carroli, and Lisa Nissen
- 375 A Narrative Review of Dual Loyalty Conflicts in Custodial Settings and Implications for Community Practice Michelle Suh, Marc David Robinson, and Holland Kaplan

393 PERSPECTIVE

Health Care Justice: Improving Emergency Response to Sexual Violence Against Deaf Women Carolina Tannenbaum-Baruchi and Orli Grinstein-Cohen

399 STUDENT ESSAY Nongovernmental Organizations: Advocates of Adolescents' Sexual and Reproductive Health Rights in Kenya Irene Tudela Tomàs

409 STUDENT ESSAY Energizing Health: Electricity Access and the Right to Health in Nigeria Oshokha Caleb Ilegogie