

## Health and Human Rights Journal

### DECEMBER 2020, VOLUME 22, NUMBER 2

#### SPECIAL SECTION

# Big Data, Technology, Artificial Intelligence and the Right to Health

GUEST EDITORS
Sara L. M. Davis and Carmel Williams

Publisher

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University

Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief
Paul Farmer

Executive Editor
Carmel Williams

Senior Editor Joseph J. Amon

Contributing Editor
Mary T. Bassett

Viewpoint Editors
Carmel Williams, Joseph J. Amon, Nina Sun, and Damon Barrett

Student Essay Editors
Audrey Chapman and Gillian MacNaughton

Copy Editor Morgan Stoffregen

Editorial Assistant Charles Andrew

Designer Catlin Rockman

#### ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Health and Human Rights Journal began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007. Health and Human Rights Journal is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

Health and Human Rights Journal is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine. It is also included in the Directory of Open Access Journals https://doaj.org/.

#### **PUBLICATION POLICY**

Health and Human Rights Journal welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 2000 words. Book reviews and Letters to the Editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at http://www.hhrjournal.org/submissions.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu. Author guidelines are available on the *Health and Human Rights* website (http://www.hhrjournal.org). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

#### COPYRIGHT POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors' work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and Health and Human Rights Journal are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

#### **OPEN ACCESS POLICY**

Health and Human Rights Journal does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access OA grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds the article processing fee is US\$2,000.

#### **BACK ISSUES**

As an open access publication, the *Health and Human Rights Journal* is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at www. hhrjournal.org, including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the *Health and Human Rights Journal* information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit http://www.jstor.org.

MASTHEAD

Publisher

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University and Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Paul E. Farmer

Executive Editor

Carmel Williams

Editor-in-Chief

Senior Editor Joseph J. Amon Contributing Editor

Mary T. Bassett

Executive Editorial Board
Jacqueline Bhabha
Audrey Chapman
Martha Davis
Sheila Davis
Linda Fried
Varun Gauri
Chidi Odinkalı

Chidi Odinkalu Jacqueline Pitanguy Alicia Ely Yamin

Founding Editor Jonathan Mann, 1994–1998 Editorial Board
Philip Alston
Agnès Binagwaho
Manuel Carballo
Brian E. Concannon Jr.

Lawrence Cox Ernest Drucker Harvey Fineberg Julio Frenk H. Jack Geiger Lawrence Gostin\* Sofia Gruskin Timothy Harding Aart Hendriks Paul Hunt Michael D. Kirby Adetokunbo O. Lucas

Adetokunbo O. Lucas Rakiya Omaar Richard Parker Thomas Pogge Julieta Rossi Barbara Rylko-Bauer Margaret L. Satterthwaite Haun Saussy

Michael Selgelid Amartya Sen Gracelyn Smallwood Margaret A. Somerville Henry J. Steiner Bryan Stevenson

Bryan Stevenson Daniel Tarantola Monika Kalra Varma Gavin Yamey

#### HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR's open access policy is made possible through the generous support of The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University, and our institutional consortium members. These include:

- Partners in Health, Boston
- Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto
- Mailman School, Columbia University, New York
- Phoenix Zones Initiative

#### **EDITORIAL OFFICE**

Health and Human Rights Journal
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights
Harvard School of Public Health
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor
Boston, MA 02115, USA
Tel: (1) 617.432.0656
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310
Website: http://www.hhrjournal.org
Email: hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu

### **Table of Contents**

# BIG DATA, TECHNOLOGY, ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE, AND THE RIGHT TO HEALTH

- EDITORIAL
  Enter the Cyborgs: Health and Human Rights
  in the Digital Age
  Sara L. M. Davis and Carmel Williams
- 7 Analyzing the Human Rights Impact of Increased Digital Public Health Surveillance during the COVID-19 Crisis Sharifah Sekalala, Stéphanie Dagron, Lisa Forman, and Benjamin Mason Meier
- 21 Human Rights and Digital Health
  Technologies
  Nina Sun, Kenechukwu Esom,
  Mandeep Dhaliwal, and Joseph J. Amon

#### **PERSPECTIVES**

- Digital Phenotyping and Digital Psychotropic Drugs: Mental Health Surveillance Tools That Threaten Human Rights Lisa Cosgrove, Justin M. Karter, Mallaigh McGinley, and Zenobia Morrill
- The Trojan Horse: Digital Health, Human Rights, and Global Health Governance Sara L. M. (Meg) Davis
- 49 Health in the Digital Age: Where Do Children's Rights Fit In?

  Louise Holly
- 55 A Health Rights Impact Assessment Guide for Artificial Intelligence Projects Carmel Williams

#### **VIEWPOINTS**

- 63 Technology, Health, and Human Rights: A Cautionary Tale for the Post-Pandemic World Rajat Khosla
- From Information to Valuable Asset: The Commercialization of Health Data as a Human Rights Issue

  Amy Dickens
- 71 Participatory Machine Learning Using Community-Based System Dynamics Vinodkumar Prabhakaran and Donald Martin Ir.
- 75 An Invitation to a Feminist Approach to Global Health Data
  Shirin Heidari and Heather Doyle
- 79 The Human Rights Challenges of Digital COVID-19 Surveillance

  Akarsh Venkatasubramanian

#### **GENERAL PAPERS**

- 85 Autonomous Health Movements: Criminalization, De-Medicalization, and Community-Based Direct Action Naomi Braine
- Toward Human Rights-Consistent Responses to Health Emergencies: What Is the Overlap between Core Right to Health Obligations and Core International Health Regulation Capacities?

  Brigit Toebes, Lisa Forman, and Giulio Bartolini

- 113 Beyond Reproduction: The "First 1,000 Days" Approach to Nutrition through a Gendered Rights-Based Lens

  Mai-Lei Woo Kinshella, Sophie E. Moore, and Rajavel Elango
- 125 A Right-to-Health Lens on Perinatal Mental Health Care in South Africa Shelley Brown, Gillian MacNaughton, and Courtenay Sprague
- 139 Establishing Good Practice for Human Rights-Based Approaches to Mental Health Care and Psychosocial Support in Kenya Faraaz Mahomed, Jacqueline Bhabha, Michael Ashley Stein, and Dainius Pūras
- 155 Intimate Partner Violence, Human Rights Violations, and HIV among Women in Nairobi, Kenya

  Courtney Andrews, Tina Kempin Reuter,

  Lauren Marsh, Judith M. Velazquez,

  Walter Jaoko, and Pauline Jolly
- 167 Assessing a Human Rights-Based Approach to HIV Testing and Partner Notification in Kenya: A Qualitative Study to Examine How Kenya's Policies and Practices Implement a Rights-Based Approach to Health Neiloy R. Sircar and Allan A. Maleche
- 177 Identifying Strategies to Advance
  Health Equity through Action on Social
  Determinants of Health and Human Rights
  for Street-Connected Children and Youth in
  Kenya
  Lonnie Embleton, Pooja Shah, Allison Amin
  Gayapersad, Reuben Kiptui, David Ayuku, and
  Paula Braitstein
- 199 Police Discrimination, Misconduct, and Stigmatization of Female Sex Workers in Kenya: Associations with Delayed and Avoided Health Care Utilization and Lower Consistent Condom Use David Kuria Mbote, Laura Nyblade, Caroline Kemunto, Kayla Giger, Joshua Kimani, Pia Mingkwan, Stella Njuguna, Emmanuel Oga, and John D. Kraemer

- 213 Community Mobilization to Promote and Protect the Sexual and Reproductive Rights of Women Living with HIV in Latin America *Tamil Kendall, Jimena Avalos Capin,* Nazneen Damji, and Eugenia Lopez Uribe
- The Right to Health in Times of Pandemic:
  What Can We Learn from the UK's Response to the COVID-19 Outbreak?

  Lisa Montel, Anuj Kapilashrami,
  Michel P. Coleman, and Claudia Allemani
- 243 A Health-Based Case against Canadian Arms Transfers to Saudi Arabia Rhonda Ferguson and Zarlasht Jamal
- 257 Underreporting of Violence to Police among
  Women Sex Workers in Canada: Amplified
  Inequities for Im/migrant and In-Call
  Workers Prior to and Following End-Demand
  Legislation
  Bronwyn McBride, Kate Shannon,
  Brittany Bingham, Melissa Braschel,
  Steffanie Strathdee, and Shira M. Goldenberg
- 271 Regulating Conscientious Objection to Legal Abortion in Argentina: Taking into Consideration Its Uses and Consequences Agustina Ramón Michel, Stephanie Kung, Alyse López-Salm, and Sonia Ariza Navarrete

#### **PERSPECTIVES**

- 285 COVID-19 Clinical Bias, Persons with Disabilities, and Human Rights
  Omar Sultan Haque and Michael Ashley Stein
- 291 EU Migration Pact Fails to Address Human Rights Concerns in Lesvos, Greece Vasileia Digidiki and Jacqueline Bhabha
- 297 Book Review: Preparing the Next Generation to Advance Human Rights in Global Health Paul Hunt

#### STUDENT ESSAY

299 The Disproportional Impact of COVID-19 on African Americans Maritza Vasquez Reyes

#### **VIEWPOINTS**

- 309 Paradigm Under Threat: Health and Human Rights Today *Jonathan Cohen*
- 313 Address Exacerbated Health Disparities and Risks to LGBTQ+ Individuals during COVID-19 Sara Wallach, Alex Garner, Sean Howell, Tyler Adamson, Stefan Baral, and Chris Beyrer
- 317 Good Health Indicators are Not Enough: Lessons from COVID-19 in Peru Camila Gianella, Ruth Iguiñiz-Romero, María José Romero, and Jasmine Gideon
- 321 Revisiting Restrictions of Rights after COVID-19 Leonard Rubenstein and Matthew DeCamp
- 325 COVID-19 in Turkmenistan: No Data, No Health Rights Aynabat Yaylymova
- 329 Ameliorating COVID-19's Disproportionate Impact on Black and Hispanic Communities: Proposed Policy Initiatives for the United States Audrey Chapman

#### VIRTUAL ROUNDTABLE

333 A Virtual Roundtable with Special Rapporteurs on the Right to Health Carmel Williams and Joseph J. Amon