

# Health and Human Rights Journal

# JUNE 2020, VOLUME 22, NUMBER 1

### SPECIAL SECTION

# Mental Health and Human Rights

GUEST EDITORS Audrey Chapman, Julie Hannah, and Dainius Pūras

Publisher

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University

Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief
Paul Farmer

Executive Editor
Carmel Williams

Senior Editor Joseph J. Amon

Contributing Editor Mary T. Bassett

Viewpoint Editors
Carmel Williams, Joseph J. Amon, Nina Sun, and Damon Barrett

Copy Editors Morgan Stoffregen, Jessica Moore Kaplan

> Designer Catlin Rockman

Editorial Assistant Charles Andrew

#### ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Health and Human Rights Journal began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007. Health and Human Rights Journal is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

Health and Human Rights Journal is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine. It is also included in the Directory of Open Access Journals https://doaj.org/.

#### **PUBLICATION POLICY**

Health and Human Rights Journal welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 2000 words. Book reviews and Letters to the Editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at http://www.hhrjournal.org/submissions.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu. Author guidelines are available on the *Health and Human Rights* website (http://www.hhrjournal.org). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

#### COPYRIGHT POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors' work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and Health and Human Rights Journal are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

#### **OPEN ACCESS POLICY**

Health and Human Rights Journal does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access OA grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds the article processing fee is US\$2,000.

## **BACK ISSUES**

As an open access publication, the *Health and Human Rights Journal* is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at www. hhrjournal.org, including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the *Health and Human Rights Journal* information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit http://www.jstor.org.

#### MASTHEAD

Publisher

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University and Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University

Editor-in-Chief Paul E. Farmer Executive Editor Carmel Williams

Senior Editor Joseph J. Amon

Contributing Editor Mary T. Bassett

Executive Editorial Board
Jacqueline Bhabha
Audrey Chapman\*
Martha Davis
Sheila Davis\*
Linda Fried
Varun Gauri
Chidi Odinkalu
Jacqueline Pitanguy
Alicia Ely Yamin

\*An asterisk denotes members of the FXB Harvard *Health and Human Rights* Publishing Consortium (see below)

Founding Editor Jonathan Mann, 1994–1998 Editorial Board
Philip Alston
Agnès Binagwaho
Manuel Carballo
Brian E. Concannon Jr.
Lawrence Cox
Ernest Drucker
Harvey Fineberg
Julio Frenk
H. Jack Geiger

H. Jack Geiger
Lawrence Gostin\*
Sofia Gruskin
Timothy Harding
Aart Hendriks
Paul Hunt
Michael D. Kirby
Adetokunbo O. Lucas
Rakiya Omaar
Richard Parker
Thomas Pogge
Julieta Rossi
Barbara Rylko-Bauer
Margaret L. Satterthwaite

Main Saussy
Michael Selgelid
Amartya Sen
Gracelyn Smallwood
Margaret A. Somerville
Henry J. Steiner
Bryan Stevenson
Daniel Tarantola
Monika Kalra Varma
Gavin Yamey

# HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR's open access policy is made possible through the generous support of The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Dornsife School of Public Health, Drexel University, and our institutional consortium members. These include:

- Partners in Health, Boston
- Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto
- Mailman School, Columbia University, New York
- O'Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.
- Chr. Michelsen Institute, Norway

#### **EDITORIAL OFFICE**

Health and Human Rights Journal
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights
Harvard School of Public Health
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor
Boston, MA 02115, USA
Tel: (1) 617.432.0656
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310
Website: http://www.hhrjournal.org
Email: hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu

## **Table of Contents**

# MENTAL HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

- 1 EDITORIAL
  - Reimagining the Mental Health Paradigm for our Collective Well-Being Audrey Chapman, Carmel Williams, Julie Hannah, and Dainius Pūras
- 7 Human Rights and Confinement of People Living with Dementia in Care Homes Linda Steele, Ray Carr, Kate Swaffer, Lyn Phillipson, and Richard Fleming
- 21 Adherence to the Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities in Czech Psychiatric Hospitals: A Nationwide Evaluation Study Petr Winkler, Lucie Kondrátová, Anna Kagstrom, Matěj Kučera, Tereza Palánová, Marie Salomonová, Petr Šturma, Zbyněk Roboch, and Melita Murko
- 35 Addressing the Problem of Severe
  Underinvestment in Mental Health and
  Well-Being from a Human Rights Perspective
  Faraaz Mahomed
- 51 Human Rights, Stigma, and Substance Use Jenifer Wogen and Maria Teresa Restrepo
- 61 Mental Health as a Basic Human Right and the Interference of Commercialized Science Lisa Cosgrove and Allen F. Shaughnessy
- PERSPECTIVE
   WHO's QualityRights Initiative:
   Transforming Services and Promoting Rights in Mental Health
   Michelle Funk and Natalie Drew Bold
- 77 Arctic Suicide, Social Medicine, and the Purview of Care in Global Mental Health Lucas Trout and Lisa Wexler

- 91 Exploring the Potential of a Rights-Based Approach to Work and Social Inclusion for People with Lived Experience of Mental Illness in Ghana
  Ursula M. Read, Lionel Sakyi, and Wendy Abbey
- 105 Crisis Response as a Human Rights
  Flashpoint: Critical Elements of Community
  Support for Individuals Experiencing
  Significant Emotional Distress
  Peter Stastny, Anne M. Lovell, Julie Hannah,
  Daniel Goulart, Alberto Vasquez, Seana
  O'Callaghan, and Dainius Pūras
- 121 A Human Rights-Based Approach to Psychiatry: Is it Possible? Emma Broberg, Agneta Persson, Anna Jacobson, and Anna-Karin Engqvist
- 133 Reconceptualizing Psychosis: The Hearing Voices Movement and Social Approaches to Health Rory Neirin Higgs

## 145 PERSPECTIVE

Traditional Healing Practices Involving Psychoactive Plants and the Global Mental Health Agenda: Opportunities, Pitfalls, and Challenges in the "Right to Science" Framework José Carlos Bouso and Constanza Sánchez-Avilés

- The Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: More Than Just Another Reform of Psychiatry Jasna Russo and Stephanie Wooley
- 163 A Key, Not a Straitjacket: The Case for Interim Mental Health Legislation Pending Complete Prohibition of Coercion in Accordance with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Laura Davidson

179 The Great March of Return: Lessons from Gaza on Mass Resistance and Mental Health Bram Wispelwey and Yasser Abu Jamei

### **GENERAL PAPERS**

- 187 Understanding US Immigration Detention: Reaffirming Rights and Addressing Social-Structural Determinants of Health Altaf Saadi, Maria-Elena De Trinidad Young, Caitlin Patler, Jeremias Leonel Estrada, and Homer Venters
- 199 Global Health in the Age of COVID-19: Responsive Health Systems Through a Right to Health Fund Eric A. Friedman, Lawrence O. Gostin, Allan Maleche, et al.
- 209 The Waitangi Tribunal's WAI 2575 Report: Implications for Decolonizing Health Systems Heather Came, Dominic O'Sullivan, Jacquie Kidd, and Timothy McCreanor
- 221 Right-to-Medicines Litigation and Universal Health Coverage: Institutional Determinants of the Judicialization of Health in Brazil Mariana P. Socal, Joseph J. Amon, and João Biehl
- 237 A Constructivist Vision of the First-Trimester Abortion Experience Sam Rowlands and Jeffrey Wale
- 251 Operationalizing a Human Rights-Based Approach to Address Mistreatment against Women during Childbirth Christina Zampas, Avni Amin, Lucinda O'Hanlon, Alisha Bjerregaard, Hedieh Mehrtash, Rajat Khosla, and Özge Tunçalp
- 265 The Neglect of Persons with Severe Brain Injury in the United States: An International Human Rights Analysis

  Tamar Ezer, Megan S. Wright, and
  Joseph J. Fins

- 279 Beyond the Pragmatic Definition? The Right to Non-discrimination of Persons with Disabilities in the Context of Coercive Interventions Sándor Gurbai
- 293 Safer Viewing: A Study of Secondary Trauma Mitigation Techniques in Open Source Investigations Elise Baker, Eric Stover, Rohini Haar, Andrea Lampros, and Alexa Koenig
- 305 Tuberculosis Care in Mexico's Chiapas Highlands Region: A Right to Health Analysis Andrea Pérez-Molina, Héctor Javier Sánchez-Pérez, Maritel Yanes-Pérez, and Marcos Arana-Cedeño
- 317 PERSPECTIVE
  Sleep Deprivation of Detained Children:
  Another Reason to End Child Detention
  Katherine R. Peeler, Kathryn Hampton, Justin
  Lucero, and Roya Ijadi-Maghsoodi
- 321 BOOK REVIEW
  Why Prosecution Is Not the Go-To Tool to
  Secure Human Rights
  Marge Berer

#### VIEWPOINTS

- Reflections on 25 Years of Health and Human Rights: History, Context, and the Need for Strategic Action Sofia Gruskin
- The Right to Health: Then, Now and a Call to Arms

  Audrey R. Chapman
- 335 Health and Human Rights at a Crossroads *Rajat Khosla*
- 339 War, Political Conflict, and the Right to Health *Leonard Rubenstein*

- 343 The Maturing Right to Health: Deeper, Broader and More Complex but Still Unequal Gillian MacNaughton
- 347 A Letter to Young and Future Leaders in Struggles for Health Rights and Social Justice Alicia Ely Yamin
- 351 Challenges in Promoting the Interdependence of all Human Rights

  Dainius Pūras
- 355 What Does it Mean to Adopt a Human Rights-Based Approach to Drug Policy? Damon Barrett, Julie Hannah, and Rick Lines
- 359 Impunity: Undermining the Health and Human Rights Consensus *Chris Beyrer*
- 363 How Can We Overcome the Great Procrastination to Respond to the Climate Emergency? Rachel Hammonds
- 367 COVID-19 and Detention: Respecting Human Rights Joseph J. Amon
- 371 Lessons from HIV to Guide COVID-19 Responses in the Central African Republic Pierre Somse and Patrick M. Eba
- 375 The Evolution of the Right to Health in the Shadow of COVID-19 *Lisa Forman*
- 379 Anti-Roma Racism is Spiraling during COVID-19 Pandemic Margareta Matache and Jacqueline Bhabha
- 383 COVID-19 Economy vs Human Rights: A Misleading Dichotomy Juan Pablo Bohoslavsky
- 387 Applying Siracusa: A Call for a General Comment on Public Health Emergencies *Nina Sun*

- 391 Upholding Rights Under COVID-19: The Respectful Maternity Care Charter R. Rima Jolivet, Charlotte E Warren, Pooja Sripad, Elena Ateva, Jewel Gausman, Kate Mitchell, Hagar Palgi Hacker, Emma Sacks, and Ana Langer
- 395 Public Money Creation to Maintain
  Fundamental Human Rights during the
  COVID-19 Pandemic
  Takondwa Chimowa, Stephen Hall, and
  Bernadette O'Hare

## VIRTUAL ROUNDTABLE

399 A Virtual Roundtable on COVID-19 and Human Rights with Human Rights Watch Researchers Joseph J. Amon and Margaret Wurth