

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

An International Journal

VOL. 7 No. 1

## Commentary

THE UN SPECIAL RAPPORTEUR ON THE RIGHT TO HEALTH: Key Objectives, Themes, and Interventions . . . . . *Paul Hunt*

## Articles

DOCUMENTATION OF TORTURE AND ILL-TREATMENT IN MEXICO: A Review of Medical Forensic Investigations, 2000 to 2002  
. . . . *Alejandro Moreno, Michele Heisler, Allen Keller, and Vincent Iacopino*

WHAT ROLE CAN INTERNATIONAL LITIGATION PLAY IN THE PROMOTION AND ADVANCEMENT OF REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA?  
. . . . . *Luisa Cabal, Mónica Roa, and Lilian Sepúlveda-Oliva*

VIOLATIONS OF REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS DURING HOSPITAL BIRTHS IN MEXICO  
. . . . . *Roberto Castro and Joaquina Erviti*

DISTRICT SURGEONS IN APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA: A Case Study of Dual Obligations  
. . . . . *Paul Gready and Jeanelle de Gruchy*

ADDRESSING COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE: An Epidemiologic Context for Human Rights Promotion  
. . . *Richard Garfield, Claudia Patricia Llantén Morales, and Elissa Dresden*

## Perspective

THE HUMANITY OF HUMANS: Philosophy, Science, Health, or Rights?  
. . . . . *Robin M. Coupland*

## Profile

HUMAN RIGHTS FROM A U.S. STATE HEALTH DEPARTMENT PERSPECTIVE  
. . . . . *Howard K. Koh, Bonnie J. Tavares, and Carlene A. Pavlos*

## Book Review

SCIENCE IN THE SERVICE OF HUMAN RIGHTS, BY RICHARD PIERRE CLAUDE  
. . . . . *Harvey M. Weinstein*



HARVARD SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for  
Health and Human Rights

*Founded through support of the Association François-Xavier Bagnoud*



## François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights

The François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights was founded at the Harvard School of Public Health in January 1993. The Center considers the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights to be inextricably linked. The Center is dedicated to exploring the conceptual dimensions and practical applications of this critical relationship. Through its concentrated focus on the intersection of health and human rights, the Center also seeks to help revitalize the field of public health and broaden human rights thinking and practice.

## Harvard School of Public Health

The Harvard School of Public Health includes more than 200 faculty members working in various disciplines of public health. The overriding mission of the School — to advance the public's health through learning and discovery — comprises four objectives: to educate scientists, professionals, and leaders in public health; to foster new discoveries and develop better technologies for improved health of individuals and populations; to inform and influence debate on key public health issues; and to strengthen capacities and services that meet health needs in the community.

## Association François-Xavier Bagnoud

The Association François-Xavier Bagnoud currently supports worldwide programs in humanitarian assistance, aerospace research for the benefit of people, and community life in the Swiss canton of Valais. Humanitarian assistance focuses on children's rights — especially the right to medical care — of children who are orphaned, abandoned, or sick, many of whom have AIDS or are HIV-infected. Projects are located in Thailand, India, Switzerland, Kenya, Uganda, Uruguay, Colombia, and the United States. The Association François-Xavier Bagnoud bears the name of a young Swiss helicopter rescue pilot who died in a helicopter accident while flying over the desert in Mali in 1986.

HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS  
An International Journal

VOL. 7 NO. 1

**Commentary**

- THE UN SPECIAL RAPPORTEUR ON THE RIGHT TO HEALTH: KEY OBJECTIVES, THEMES,  
AND INTERVENTIONS . . . . . 1  
*PAUL HUNT*

**Articles**

- DOCUMENTATION OF TORTURE AND ILL-TREATMENT IN MEXICO: A REVIEW OF  
MEDICAL FORENSIC INVESTIGATIONS, 2000 TO 2002 . . . . . 28  
*ALEJANDRO MORENO, MICHELE HEISLER, ALLEN KELLER, AND VINCENT IACOPINO*
- WHAT ROLE CAN INTERNATIONAL LITIGATION PLAY IN THE PROMOTION AND  
ADVANCEMENT OF REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA? . . . . . 50  
*LUISA CABAL, MÓNICA ROA, AND LILIAN SEPÚLVEDA-OLIVA*
- VIOLATIONS OF REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS DURING HOSPITAL BIRTHS IN MEXICO . . . . . 90  
*ROBERTO CASTRO AND JOAQUINA ERVITI*
- DISTRICT SURGEONS IN APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA: A CASE STUDY OF DUAL  
OBLIGATIONS . . . . . 112  
*PAUL GREADY AND JEANELLE DE GRUCHY*
- ADDRESSING COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE: AN EPIDEMIOLOGIC CONTEXT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS  
PROMOTION. . . . . 144  
*RICHARD GARFIELD, CLAUDIA PATRICIA LLANTÉN MORALES, AND ELISSA DRESDEN*

**Perspective**

- THE HUMANITY OF HUMANS: PHILOSOPHY, SCIENCE, HEALTH, OR RIGHTS? . . . . . 159  
*ROBIN M. COUPLAND*

**Profile**

- HUMAN RIGHTS FROM A U.S. STATE HEALTH DEPARTMENT PERSPECTIVE . . . . . 167  
*HOWARD K. KOH, BONNIE J. TAVARES, AND CARLENE A. PAVLOS*

**Book Review**

- SCIENCE IN THE SERVICE OF HUMAN RIGHTS, BY RICHARD PIERRE CLAUDE . . . . . 175  
*HARVEY M. WEINSTEIN*

*Health and Human Rights* is a peer-reviewed international journal dedicated to studying the relationships between human rights and health. The journal examines the effects of human rights violations on health; the impacts of health policies on human rights; and the inextricable nature of the relationship between the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights.

#### **PUBLICATION POLICY**

*Health and Human Rights* welcomes unsolicited manuscripts. Authors should send their manuscripts to the Editorial Office at the address below. Guidelines for authors can be found in the back of this issue and at [www.hsph.harvard.edu](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu) or obtained by writing to the Editorial Office. Issues of international impact and significance for health and human rights are of particular interest.

Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of *Health and Human Rights* officers, editors, or other members.

#### **EDITORIAL/SUBSCRIPTION OFFICE**

*Health and Human Rights*  
Harvard School of Public Health  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Building  
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor  
Boston, MA 02115, USA  
[fxbcenter@igc.apc.org](mailto:fxbcenter@igc.apc.org)  
[www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal)  
Tel: (1) 617.432.4611  
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310

#### **ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING**

*Health and Human Rights* is abstracted and indexed in ASSIA: *Applied Social Science Index and Abstracts*, *Geographical Abstracts: Human Geography*, *International Bibliography of the Health Sciences*, *International Development Abstracts*, *A Matter of Fact*, *MEDLINE*, *PAIS International*, *Periodica Islamica*, *Social Planning/Policy and Development Abstracts*, and *Sociological Abstracts*.

*Health and Human Rights* is published twice a year.

---

#### **SUBSCRIPTION AND PURCHASE RATES (in U.S. dollars)**

	2 issues (1 year)	4 issues (2 years)
Students	\$20	\$35
Individuals	\$28	\$45
Institutions	\$60	\$110
Individual Sponsorship	\$34/\$68/\$102	

[Sponsorship helps subsidize free distribution in developing countries.]

Individuals in developing countries may qualify for a free 4-issue subscription by writing a letter of request to the Subscription Office.

Single and back issues are \$15, including postage.

**FOREIGN POSTAGE:** Canada, add \$6/2 issues plus 7% GST (#042103580). All other foreign, add \$8/2 issues.

---

*Health and Human Rights* (ISSN 1079-0969) is published by the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights of the Harvard School of Public Health.

 This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/ISO Z39.48-1992  
(Permanence of paper)

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

## Editor

Sofia Gruskin

## Senior Advisory Board

Philip Alston  
Hina Jilani  
Halfdan Mahler

V. Ramalingaswami  
Henry Steiner  
Katarina Tomaševski

## Editorial Board

Sunila Abeysekera  
Manuel Carballo  
Lincoln Chen  
Ernest Drucker  
Paul Epstein  
Richard Feachem  
Harvey Fineberg  
Julio Frenk  
H. Jack Geiger  
Lawrence Gostin  
Mirko D. Grmek  
Timothy Harding  
Aart Hendriks  
Hakima Himmich  
Emmanuel Hirsch  
Howard Hu  
Peter Kandela  
Michael D. Kirby  
Slobodan Lang  
John F. Lauer  
Maureen Law  
Jennifer Leaning

Ana Luisa Liguori  
Adetokunbo O. Lucas  
Stephen P. Marks  
Gerald Nagler  
Aryeh Neier  
Richard Parker  
Geneviève Pinet  
Peter Piot  
Jacqueline Pitanguy  
Olikoye Ransome-Kuti  
Jon E. Rohde  
Renée Sabatier  
Amartya Sen  
Gracelyn Smallwood  
Margaret A. Somerville  
Eric Stover  
Donna Sullivan  
Daniel Tarantola  
Lorenzo Tomatis  
Nahid Toubia  
Laurie Wiseberg

## Founding Editor

Jonathan Mann 1947–1998

**Assistant Editor:** Susan Isenstein

**Assistant Managing Editor:** M. Warren Hancock

**Editorial Assistant:** Amy Flick

**Design and Layout:** Catlin Rockman