

# Health and Human Rights Journal

JUNE 2016, VOLUME 18, NUMBER 1

## Special Section: Tuberculosis and the Right to Health

Publisher: Harvard University Press

*Editor-in-Chief*  
Paul Farmer

*Guest Editors*  
Brian Citro  
Evan Lyon  
Mihir Mankad  
Kiran Raj Pandey  
Camila Gianella

*Executive Editor*  
Carmel Williams

*Senior Editor*  
Jessica Moore Kaplan

*Contributing Editor*  
Arlan Fuller

*Designer*  
Catlin Rockman

## ABOUT THE JOURNAL

*Health and Human Rights Journal* began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007. *Health and Human Rights Journal* is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

*Health and Human Rights Journal* is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine.

## PUBLICATION POLICY

*Health and Human Rights Journal* welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 2000 words. Book reviews and Letters to the Editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at <http://www.hhrjournal.org/submissions>.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to [HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu). Author guidelines are available on the *Health and Human Rights* website (<http://www.hhrjournal.org>). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

## COPYRIGHT POLICY

*Health and Human Rights Journal* applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors' work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and *Health and Human Rights Journal* are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

## OPEN ACCESS POLICY

*Health and Human Rights Journal* does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access OA grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds the article processing fee is US\$2,000.

## BACK ISSUES

As an open access publication, the *Health and Human Rights Journal* is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at [www.hhrjournal.org](http://www.hhrjournal.org), including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the *Health and Human Rights Journal* information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit <http://www.jstor.org>.

*Health and Human Rights Journal* (online) ISSN 2150-4113

## MASTHEAD

*Publisher*  
Harvard University Press

*Editor-in-Chief*  
Paul E. Farmer

*Executive Editor*  
Carmel Williams

*Senior Editor*  
Jessica Moore Kaplan

*Contributing Editor*  
Arlan Fuller

### *Executive Editorial Board*

Cathy Albisa\*  
Jacqueline Bhabha  
Oscar Cabrera\*  
Audrey Chapman\*  
Martha Davis  
Sheila Davis\*  
Linda Fried  
Varun Gauri  
Howard Hu\*  
Jennifer Leaning  
Emmanuel Kabengele Mpinga\*  
Chidi Odinkalu  
Jacqueline Pitanguy  
Eric Stover\*  
Alicia Ely Yamin

\*An asterisk denotes members of the Harvard FXB *Health and Human Rights* Publishing Consortium (see below)

*Founding Editor*  
Jonathan Mann, 1994-1998

*Editorial Board*  
Philip Alston  
Agnès Binagwaho  
Manuel Carballo  
Brian E. Concannon Jr.  
Lawrence Cox  
Ernest Drucker  
Harvey Fineberg  
Julio Frenk  
H. Jack Geiger  
Lawrence Gostin\*  
Sofia Gruskin  
Timothy Harding  
Aart Hendriks  
Paul Hunt  
Michael D. Kirby  
Adetokunbo O. Lucas  
Rakiya Omaar  
Richard Parker  
Thomas Pogge  
Julieta Rossi  
Barbara Rylko-Bauer  
Margaret L. Satterthwaite  
Haun Saussy  
Michael Selgelid  
Amartya Sen  
Gracelyn Smallwood  
Margaret A. Somerville  
Henry J. Steiner  
Bryan Stevenson  
Daniel Tarantola  
Monika Kalra Varma  
Gavin Yamey

## HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR's open access policy is made possible through the generous support of Harvard University Press, The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, and our institutional consortium members. These include:

- Partners in Health, Boston
- Human Rights Institute, University of Connecticut
- Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto
- Mailman School, Columbia University, New York
- Institute of Global Health, Faculty of Medicine, Geneva University
- National Economic & Social Rights Initiative, New York
- O'Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.
- Dept of Public Policy, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

## EDITORIAL OFFICE

*Health and Human Rights Journal*  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights  
Harvard School of Public Health  
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor  
Boston, MA 02115, USA  
Tel: (1) 617.432.0656  
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310  
Website: <http://www.hhrjournal.org>  
Email: [hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu)

# Table of Contents

## SPECIAL SECTION ON TUBERCULOSIS AND THE RIGHT TO HEALTH

*in collaboration with the International Human Rights Clinic, University of Chicago Law School*

- 1 Editorial: Developing a Human Rights-Based Approach to Tuberculosis  
*Brian Citro, Evan Lyon, Mihir Mankad, Kiran Raj Pandey, and Camila Gianella, Guest Editors*
- 9 Falling Short of the Rights to Health and Scientific Progress: Inadequate TB Drug Research and Access  
*Mike Frick, Ian Henry, and Erica Lessem*
- 25 Multidrug-Resistant TB: Implementing the Right to Health through the Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress  
*Leslie London, Helen Cox, and Fons Coomans*
- 43 Detention of People Lost to Follow-Up on TB Treatment in Kenya: The Need for Human Rights-Based Alternatives  
*Gitau Mburu, Enrique Restoy, Evaline Kibuchi, Paula Holland, and Anthony D. Harries*
- 55 TB in Vulnerable Populations: The Case of an Indigenous Community in the Peruvian Amazon  
*Camila Gianella, César Ugarte-Gil, Godofredo Caro, Rula Aylas, César Castro, and Claudia Lema*
- 69 Litigation as TB Rights Advocacy: A New Delhi Case Study  
*Kerry McBroom*
- 85 Double Standards in Global Health: Medicine, Human Rights Law, and Multidrug-Resistant TB Treatment Policy  
*Thomas Nicholson, Catherine Admay, Aaron Shakow, and Salmaan Keshavjee*

## PERSPECTIVE ESSAYS ON TUBERCULOSIS AND THE RIGHT TO HEALTH

- 103 Petition 329: A Legal Challenge to the Involuntary Confinement of TB Patients in Kenyan Prisons  
*Allan Maleche and Nerima Were*
- 109 Rights-Based TB Programs for Migrants and Prisoners Needed in North Korea  
*Sandra Fahy*

## GENERAL PAPERS

- 115 Biosocial Approaches to the 2013-2016 Ebola Pandemic  
*Eugene T. Richardson, Mohamed Bailor Barrie, J. Daniel Kelly, Yusupha Dibba, Songor Koedoyoma, and Paul E. Farmer*

- 129 An Independent Review and Accountability Mechanism for the Sustainable Development Goals: The Possibilities of a Framework Convention on Global Health  
*Eric A. Friedman*

- 141 Essential Medicines in National Constitutions: Progress Since 2008  
*S. Katrina Perehudoff, Brigit Toebes, and Hans Hogerzeil*

- 157 Opening the Door to Zero New HIV Infections in Closed Settings  
*Anna Torriente, Alexander Tadion, and Lee-Nah Hsu*

- 169 The HIV and AIDS Tribunal of Kenya: An Effective Mechanism for the Enforcement of HIV-Related Human Rights?  
*Patrick Michael Eba*

- 181 Human Trafficking Identification and Service Provision in the Medical and Social Service Sectors  
*Corinne Schwarz, Erik Unruh, Katie Cronin, Sarah Evans-Simpson, Hannah Britton, and Megha Ramaswamy*

- 193 The Paradox of Happiness: Health and Human Rights in the Kingdom of Bhutan  
*Benjamin Mason Meier and Averi Chakrabarti*

- 209 The Judicialization of Health and the Quest for State Accountability: Evidence from 1,262 Lawsuits for Access to Medicines in Southern Brazil  
*João Biehl, Mariana P. Socal, and Joseph J. Amon*

- 221 Indigenous Child Health in Brazil: The Evaluation of Impacts as a Human Rights Issue  
*Anna R. Coates, Sandra del Pino Marchito, and Bernardino Vitoy*

- 235 Assessing and Improving Children's Rights in Hospitals: Case Studies from Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Moldova  
*Ana Isabel Fernandes Guerreiro, Aigul Kuttumuratova, Kubanychbek Monolbaev, Larisa Boderscova, Zulfiya Pirova, and Martin W. Weber*

- 249 Childhood Obesity and the Right to Health  
*Katharina Ó Cathaoir*

- 263 Human Rights-Based Approaches to Mental Health: A Review of Programs  
*Sebastian Porsdam Mann, Valerie J. Bradley, and Barbara J. Sahakian*

## PERSPECTIVE ESSAYS

- 277 Medical Hostages: Detention of Women and Babies in Hospitals  
*Delan Devakumar and Rob Yates*

- 283 Corruption, Proportionality, and their Challenges  
*Michael Kirby*